

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b></p> <p><b>December 12, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 1 of 5</b></p>
---	--	---------------------------

#### **Committee Members Present**

Captain George Livingstone, Committee Chairman, Commissioner  
Dave Connolly, Board Vice President  
John Schneider, Commissioner  
Captain Andrew Murray, Port Agent Designee, San Francisco Bar Pilot

#### **Committee Members Absent**

Jennifer Schmid, President

#### **Staff Present**

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director  
Roma Cristia-Plant, Assistant Director  
Luis Cruz, Staff Services Analyst

#### **Public Present**

LCDR Krysia Pohl, United States Coast Guard, Chief, Inspections Division  
LCDR Matthew Zinn, United States Coast Guard, Chief, Investigations Division  
Raymond Paetzold, Business Director-General Counsel, San Francisco Bar Pilots (SFBP)

#### **1. Call to Order and Roll Call.**

Chairman Livingstone called the meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Staff Services Analyst Luis Cruz called roll and confirmed a quorum.

#### **2. Approval of the minutes of the Committee meeting held on June 30, 2015 (Chairman Livingstone)**

Committee members were presented the draft minutes from the meeting held June 30, 2015. Commissioner Connolly suggested one change to the discussion of the study on under-keel clearance. The members present agreed to the change. There was no other discussion or public comment on the minutes. Vice President Connolly noted that agenda items #5 and 6 discussed at the June 30, 2015, Committee meeting were not on the current Committee agenda, but have been discussed by the Board at Board meetings. Mr. Paetzold stated that the Committee may wish to have several standing Committee agenda items.

**MOTION:** Vice President Connolly moved to approve the draft minutes of the meeting held on June 30, 2015, as amended. Captain Murray seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Yes: Livingstone, Connolly, Murray, and Schneider.  
No: None.  
Abstain: None.

**ACTION:** The motion passed.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b></p> <p><b>December 12, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun</b>  <b>660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING</b>  <b>MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 2 of 5</b></p>
---	--	---------------------------

**3. Develop a mission statement and focus for the Committee. Possible Committee action to recommend to the Board a Committee mission statement and focus. (Chairman Livingstone)**

The Committee considered a previous version of the mission statement and a more concise version edited by Captain Murray. There was discussion of whether the category “human element” needed to be specifically mentioned under the broader category of risk. Following a minor edit, the Committee decided to vote on the version prepared by Captain Murray. There was no further discussion by the Committee or the public.

**MOTION:** Vice President Connolly moved to approve the mission statement prepared by Captain Murray, as amended. Captain Murray seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** YES: Livingstone, Connolly, Murray, and Schneider.  
NO: None.  
ABSTAIN: None.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved.

**4. Review and discuss the status of the under keel clearance (UKC) study for San Francisco Bay Main Ship Channel. (San Francisco Bar Pilots Captains Hurt and McCloy)**

Chairman Livingstone gave a report on the status of the UKC study commissioned by the SFBP for Captains Hurt and McCloy. He stated the pilots initiated a study to develop an objective tool to safely move larger ships across the bar under adverse weather conditions. He reported that an Australian company provided the SFBP with motion sensors to collect data from vessels over two winters. He stated the researchers used this data along with buoy data to analyze the UKC for six different classes of vessels. The end result is that the SFBP will have access to a matrix that will classify individual ship depending on weather conditions. He reported that it will be about one month or so before the final results and study recommendations are in.

Chairman Livingstone confirmed for Commissioner Schneider that historically there appears to be approximately one event every 12-18 months that is significant enough to halt ship traffic across the bar, and that the study will not result in a predicative tool (dynamic UKC in real time), since that type of research modeling would have been more costly. He stated that initial study data appears to confirm the SFBP’s current policy of requiring a 10 foot UKC that would allow for a 6 foot loss of UKC during inclement weather.

**5. Review and discuss recent pilot boarding arrangements deficiencies. Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to pursue actions to mitigate pilot boarding arrangement deficiencies. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Chairman Livingstone requested Board staff to collect data on pilot boarding arrangement deficiencies reported to the Board for the past five years, and then the Committee could review and

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b></p> <p><b>December 12, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 3 of 5</b></p>
---	--	---------------------------

make safety recommendations to the Board. There was a discussion of the seriousness of the problem, and that the issue may be underreported by pilots.

Mr. Garfinkle stated that he routinely conveys pilot boarding arrangements deficiency reports to the U.S. Coast Guard (USCG) Port State Control, but, that he does not follow up with the USCG when a pilot or trainee is injured. USCG representatives Pohl and Zinn stated that the USCG has tools in place to track pilot boarding arrangement deficiencies, and could do a better job of closing the loop with the Board. They also stated that the USCG does perform ladder inspections, and that under the authority of the Code of Federal Regulations can take action and issue deficiency notices, and letters of warning or violations. Chairman Livingstone commented that potentially the pilots could provide training to USCG inspectors on ladder issues.

Chairman Livingstone summarized the following potential actions to follow up on pilot boarding arrangement deficiencies:

1. Board staff to collect pilot ladder deficiency data for the prior five-year period, and report the data to the USCG.
  2. Staff to develop a process to open lines of communication with the USCG to obtain information regarding the federal agency's actions taken regarding a reported deficiency.
  3. Consider the possibility of pilots providing pilot ladder inspection training to USCG inspectors.
  4. Pilots to be encouraged to report pilot ladder deficiencies to the Board, which will hopefully lead to better enforcement.
- 6. Review and discuss recent instances of pilots being provided inaccurate air draft information which have resulted in allisions with overhead structures. Possible Committee recommendation to the Board to pursue actions to mitigate inaccurate air draft information being provided to pilots. (Chairman Livingstone)**

Chairman Livingstone requested that Board staff collect the data from Incident Review Committee (IRC) reports for cases in which there was an incident involving inaccurate air draft information. Executive Director Garfinkle noted that there have been no instances where the IRC found a pilot at fault when a bridge strike was related to inaccurate air draft information.

Vice President Connolly stated that inaccurate information is the problem, and that the risks can be enormous if a bridge is damaged. Commission Schneider commented that maybe a potential solution is to have ships move by an electronic eye that would measure the height of ship's masts. Executive Director Garfinkle commented that the issue is a class society issue, and that ship measurement data is typically only generated when the ships are new, and do not capture the impacts of later modifications. Captain Murray stated that ship owners should be made to check data for modifications involving the addition of antennas and other equipment.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b></p> <p><b>December 12, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 4 of 5</b></p>
---	--	---------------------------

Chairman Livingstone instructed Board staff to gather the data for antenna incidents for the past five year and present to the Committee at the next meeting. He also added that maybe the data should be shared with the USCG.

**7. Public comment on matters not on the agenda.**

There were no comments from the public.

**8. Schedule the next Committee meeting, and proposals for the next Committee meeting agenda.**

Executive Director Garfinkle noted that he abbreviated this agenda today to focus on the agenda items listed. He left off agenda items covering the following issues that could be included in future Committee meeting agendas:

- USCG recommendation for a change in training periodicity of Radar navigation in low visibility/restricted waters training.
- Evaluation of pilots while underway.
- MANOA container overboard loss incident. The Committee decided not to pursue this item as the event falls outside of the Board's ability to effect a remedy. The USCG representatives stated that they could check their records and report by to Executive Director Garfinkle.
- PETERSBURG grounding. The Committee decided not to pursue this item, as one of the obvious remedies is to dredge a channel to the Reserve Fleet, and that dredging of federal ship channels is the responsibility of the Army Corp of Engineers. It was discussed that there are other remedies within the control of the SFBP, one example of which is to limit movements of ships moored in the Reserve Fleet to times when the tide provides for safe movement.
- Pilot fatigue issues. This was tabled pending the results of the active fatigue study being conducted by San Jose State University Research Foundation.

The Committee discussed meeting jointly with the Continuing Education Committee, and receive a report from the SFBP Continuing Professional Development Committee regarding changes and/or updates to the combination course training taught at the California State University Maritime Academy.

Vice President Connolly commented that near misses and losses of propulsion pose safety issues that the Committee may wish to review. Chairman Livingstone stated that the SFBP has a rescue towing plan for distressed vessels that provides for a pre-determined horizontal emergency communication in such instances.

There was also a request to review and include in future agendas any updates from the American Pilot Association on issues identified in today's agenda items five and six.

<p><b>Meeting Date:</b></p> <p><b>December 12, 2017</b></p>	<p><b>Board of Pilot Commissioners for the Bays of San Francisco, San Pablo, and Suisun 660 Davis Street, San Francisco, CA 94111</b></p> <p><b>PILOT SAFETY COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES</b></p>	<p><b>Page 5 of 5</b></p>
---	--	---------------------------

The Committee scheduled the next meeting for February 6, 2018.

**9. Adjournment.**

**MOTION:** Vice President Connolly moved adjourn the meeting. Commissioner Schneider seconded the motion.

**VOTE:** Yes: Livingstone, Connolly, Murray, and Schneider.  
No: None.

Abstain: None.

**ACTION:** The meeting was adjourned at 11:35 a.m.

Submitted by:




---

Allen Garfinkle, Executive Director